Douglas F. Gansler Attorney General

KATHERINE WINFREE
Chief Deputy Attorney General

JOHN B. HOWARD, JR. Deputy Attorney General



DAN FRIEDMAN
Counsel to the General Assembly

SANDRA BENSON BRANTLEY
BONNIE A. KIRKLAND
KATHRYN M. ROWE
Assistant Attorneys General

## THE ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MARYLAND OFFICE OF COUNSEL TO THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY October 10, 2012

The Honorable Michael E. Busch Speaker of the House of Delegates 100 State Circle Annapolis, Maryland 21401

Re: Delegate Tiffany Alston

Dear Speaker Busch:

You have asked for my legal advice regarding the status of Delegate Tiffany Alston in light of her sentencing for misconduct in office. It is my view that she has now been suspended from elective office by operation of law without pay or benefits.<sup>1</sup>

The relevant constitutional provision in pertinent part provides that:

Any elected official of the State ... who during [her] term of office is convicted of or enters a plea of *nolo contendere* to any crime which is a felony, or which is a misdemeanor related to [her] public duties and responsibilities and involves moral turpitude for which the penalty may be incarceration in any penal institution, shall be suspended by operation of law without pay or benefits from the elective office.

Md. Const., Art. XV, §2. On June 5, 2012, Delegate Alston was found guilty by a jury of the crime of misconduct in office. It is my view that this crime is (1) a misdemeanor; (2) related to her public duties; (3) involves moral turpitude;<sup>2</sup> and (4) carries a potential

Because it is important to provide immediate clarity on the issue of whether Delegate Alston has been suspended, I have provided this advice on an expedited basis and without addressing other potential ramifications of Delegate Alston's criminal case.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Stidwell v. State Bd. of Chiropractic Examiners, 144 Md. App. 613, 618-19 (2002) ("Our review ... reveals that, whereas for trials, the expression "moral turpitude" speaks primarily to truthfulness, for the business of professional licensing and public appointments, the expression strikes the broader chord of public confidence in the administration of government.").

The Honorable Michael E. Busch October 10, 2012 Page 2

penalty of incarceration, and, therefore, is a qualifying crime under this provision. A guilty verdict, however, does not become a "conviction" under Maryland law until the time of sentencing. 62 Opinions of the Attorney General 365, 371 (1977). As a result, Delegate Alston was allowed to continue in office after she was found guilty. On October 9, 2012, Delegate Alston was sentenced to a term of one year of incarceration, suspended, for this crime. A copy of the certified conviction is attached hereto as **Exhibit 1**. At the moment that sentence was pronounced, the constitutional provision was triggered and Delegate Alston was suspended from her office.

Pursuant to the constitutional provision, during her suspension Delegate Alston is not entitled to the "pay or benefits" of her office. In 1977, Attorney General Burch provided advice about how this provision was to be interpreted during the suspension from office of Governor Marvin Mandel. 62 *Opinions of the Attorney General* 464 (1977). If you need further guidance on how this is to be applied to Delegate Alston, please do not hesitate to ask.

Delegate Alston's suspension from office also triggered the process for appointing a person to temporarily fill her position as a delegate from the 24th legislative district. Pursuant to the Constitution, "[d]uring and for the period of suspension of the elected official, the appropriate governing body and/or official authorized by law to fill any vacancy in the elective office shall appoint a person to temporarily fill the elective office." The authority for filing vacancies in the General Assembly is provided by Article III, section 13, which provides that "the Central Committee of the political party, if any, with which the Delegate ... had been affiliated at the time of the last election" has 30 days to submit a list of names to the Governor from which to select a new Delegate. Thus, the Democratic Central Committee for Prince George's County has 30 days from yesterday to forward the names of potential temporary replacements to the Governor. See Md. Const., Art. III, §13(a). The Governor then has 15 days to select a temporary replacement.

Very truly yours,

an Friedman

Counsel to the General Assembly

	Detendant's Name: 11++any Alston / AKU 1,	+tany A. OTTAY
	Indee DAIN E MADDIC ID	Prosecutor: E. Davitt/S. Glenn
	Judge: PAUL F. HARRIS, JR	Def. Atty: J. Gordon R. Abdullah
V-2	Case called for: Sentencing	Clerk: Howland Ctrm:3B
4	N'. N-7002-000 49-6  Counsel Heard □ Pass for Trial □ Reset for Sta	tus Conference
	Postponement Request by: State Defenda	nt DNA/Forensic Evidence is unavailable
	☐ Good Cause found-Granted ☐ Denied ☐ Hicks V	Vaived Defearressly consents to postnonement
	A waives all appealate right	-s oper plea digreement w/
	New Trial / Hrg Date:	Motion Hearing Date:
	☐ State moved to place case on Stet Docket – Granted	
	Advised of Rights (Rule 4-213), referred OPD Co	
	•	ddress Verified / Information Sheet Filed
	☐ Bench Warrant Issued for Defendant's Failure to App ☐ Bond Forfeited – NISI ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐	nd set at COPY OF Signal
	Defendant appeared later same day	nd set at Olaco Olaco Olaco
	Bench warrant withdrawn: Bond forfeiture stricken	Plea agreement fited and bond reinstated in spen court in
	Bond set at	and bound remistation (N) open court IN
20	Defendant Released on Personal Recognizance	□ Pretrial - Level 1 2 3 4 5 6-11-2040
20	PLEA:	
2012 OCT	☐ Guilty Count(s)	
1	□ Not Guilty □ Agreed Statement of Facts (	Count
٠ نــ	Advised of Rights	1 > (Motion for appropriate
<b>]</b> >	Jury Trial Waived	popen Motions Withdrawn (e) ef) w
	Statement of Facts presented Via probation report Testimony taken	
_		
 	Motion for Judgment of Acquittal: ☐Granted ☐	Denied: A served w/ Civil
	Motion for Judgment of Acquittar.	Bellieu. Service of Children
	•	
	FINDING: COURT/JURY  □Not Guilty to Counts	
,	☐Not Guilty to Counts	
as.	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to	
as.	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to	
as; ch: on!	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to	to Count(s)
as ch on	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to	Stay under Criminal Procedure Article Sec 6-220(b)
as; ch: on!	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to:	Stay under Criminal Procedure Article Sec. 6-220(b)
as: ch: on!	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to Guilty Finding Stricken - Entry of Judgment S	Stay under Criminal Procedure Article Sec. 6-220(b)
as ct. onl	□ Not Guilty to Counts □ Guilty to Counts □ Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □ Guilty Finding Stricken - Entry of Judgment S □ Disposition continued to: □ P.S.I. ordered □ Special directions:	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth Clark
as chi on	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □ Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By: Deputy
as ch on	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □ Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □ Remain on same bond	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:  Changed to
as ct.	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □ Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □ Remain on same bond □Disposition: □County Detention Center	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:Deputy  Changed toDeputy
as C+*	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □ Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □ Remain on same bond	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:  Changed to
as ch on	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □ Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □ Remain on same bond □Disposition: □County Detention Center	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:Deputy  Changed toDeputy
as ct	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □ Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □ Remain on same bond Disposition: □County Detention Center for a period of C → C → COUNT	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:Deputy  Changed to  Commissioner of Corrections Suspend all but
as Ch	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to Guilty Finding Stricken - Entry of Judgment \( \) □ Disposition continued to: □ P.S.I. ordered □ Special directions: □ Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □ Revoked □ Remain on same bond Disposition: □ County Detention Center for a period of \( \)	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:Deputy  Changed to Commissioner of Corrections Suspend all but
as ch on	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □ Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □Remain on same bond Disposition: □County Detention Center for a period of □ P.S.I. Ordered □County Detention Center	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By: Deputy  Changed to Deputy  Commissioner of Corrections Suspend all but  edit for time served Live-in-work-out Ordered/Recommended
as: ct:	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □ Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □Remain on same bond Disposition: □County Detention Center for a period of □ Probation continued. □Probation closed — unsatis	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By: Changed to Commissioner of Corrections Suspend all but  edit for time served Live-in-work-out Ordered/Recommended offactory  DNA Testing by
as Chi	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to Guilty Finding Stricken - Entry of Judgment Subsposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □ Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □ Remain on same bond Disposition: □County Detention Center for a period of □Probation continued. □Probation closed - unsatist □Probation continued. □Probation closed - unsatist □Probation placed on Supervise Opro	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:Deputy  Changed to Commissioner of Corrections Suspend all but  cdit for time served Live-in-work-out Ordered/Recommended sfactory  DNA Testing by bation for:Deputy
as: ch: on!	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to  □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to  □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to  □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to  □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to  □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to  □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to  □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminal	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:Deputy  Changed toDeputy  Changed toDeputy  Live-in-work-out Ordered/Recommended of actory DNA Testing by treatment, education, NA/AA, random urine per P&P
as: ct	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □Remain on same bond Disposition: □County Detention Center for a period of □Probation closed - unsatis □Defendant placed on Supervise □Pro □Successfully complete any drug/alcohol counseling, □Successfully complete any drug/alcohol counseling,	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:Deputy  Changed toDeputy  Commissioner of Corrections  Suspend all but  dit for time served, 20 Live-in-work-out Ordered/Recommended factory DNA Testing by bation for: Service A+ A  COMMUNITY SETVICE A+ A
as : ch:	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □Remain on same bond Disposition: □County Detention Center for a period of C → 2 - \ Cay □Cre Sentence to begin on □Probation continued. □Probation closed - unsatis □Defendant placed on Supervised Processifully complete any drugalcohol counseling, □Complete 300 hours of	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:  Changed to  Commissioner of Corrections  Suspend all but  cdit for time served  , 20  Live-in-work-out Ordered/Recommended factory  DNA Testing by bation for:  Year  TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:  Deputy  Changed to  Community  Suspend all but  Community  Suspend all but  Community  Suspend all but  Community  Com
as : ch:	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □Remain on same bond Disposition: □County Detention Center for a period of CA 2 - \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:  Changed to  Commissioner of Corrections  structure and all but  Edit for time served  , 20  Live-in-work-out Ordered/Recommended afactory  bation for:  Years  treatment, education, NA/AA, random urine per P&P  Community Service at a  of it, non-government agency.
as: ct	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □Remain on same bond Disposition: □County Detention Center for a period of C→ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:Deputy  Changed to  Commissioner of Corrections  Suspend all but  Commissioner of Corrections  Live-in-work-out Ordered/Recommended  Stactory DNA Testing by  Community Service at a  Ofit non-government agency.  Canyy  Corrections  Conyy  Corrections  Conyy  Community Service at a  Ofit non-government agency.  Conyy  Corrections  Conyy  Court Costs due
as chi	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Disposition continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □Remain on same bond □Disposition: □County Detention Center for a period of □ → □ → □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □ □	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:Deputy  Changed to  Commissioner of Corrections  suspend all but  Commissioner of Corrections  Live-in-work-out Ordered/Recommended  factory DNA Testing by bation for: YEATS  treatment, education, NA/AA, random urine per P&P  Community Service at a  OFICE Non-government agency.  To CICF \$ 45.00
ch.	□Not Guilty to Counts □Guilty to Counts □Defendant Guilty-Not Criminally Responsible to □Defendant Continued to: □P.S.I. ordered □Special directions: □Court ordered 8-505 evaluation (order in file)  Bond: □Revoked □Remain on same bond □Disposition: □Probation Center for a period of □Probation Center for a period of □Probation closed - unsatisty □Defendant placed on □Pr	TRUE COPY TEST: Robert Duckworth, Clerk By:  Changed to  Commissioner of Corrections  structure and all but  Edit for time served  , 20  Live-in-work-out Ordered/Recommended afactory  bation for:  Years  treatment, education, NA/AA, random urine per P&P  Community Service at a  of it, non-government agency.